



# ROADMAP FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A WORLD FORUM ON RAW MATERIALS

Roadmap, Pilot and Recommendations





## Table of Contents

| De  | liver | rable D.4.1                                                                         |
|-----|-------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Dis | sclai | mer3                                                                                |
| Exe | ecut  | ive Summary4                                                                        |
| 1   |       | Introduction5                                                                       |
| 2   |       | Results Stakeholder Dialogue6                                                       |
|     | 2.1   | Needs for improved collection of data and exchange of knowledge7                    |
|     | 2.2   | Options for improving international policy approaches and legislations7             |
|     | 2.3   | Role of a World Forum on Raw Materials in enhancing international cooperation8      |
| 3   |       | Recommended Organizational Models for improving International Cooperation9          |
| 4   |       | Key Stakeholders and Preferred Focus Areas for enhanced International Cooperation11 |
| 5   |       | Next Steps for FORAM Platform                                                       |





# Deliverable D.4.1

# Roadmap for the Establishment of a World Forum on Raw Materials

| Project:<br>Acronym:<br>Grant Agreement:<br>Funding Scheme:<br>Webpage:<br>Work Package:<br>Work Package Leader:<br>Deliverable Title: | Towards a World Forum on Raw Materials<br>FORAM<br>730127<br>Horizon 2020<br>www.foramproject.net<br>4<br>World Resources Forum Association (WRFA)<br>Roadmap for the Establishment of a World Forum<br>on Raw Materials      |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Deliverable Number:<br>Deliverable Leader:<br>Involved beneficiaries:<br>Dissemination level:<br>Version:<br>Status:<br>Authors:       | <ul> <li>4.1</li> <li>World Resources Forum Association (WRFA)</li> <li>UNU, EFG, EGS</li> <li>Public</li> <li>3.0</li> <li>Final</li> <li>Bas de Leeuw (WRFA)</li> <li>FORAM Management Committee (WRFA, EGS, EFG</li> </ul> |
| Reviewed by:<br>Approved by:<br>Date:                                                                                                  | and UNU)<br>FORAM Management Committee (WRFA, EGS, EFG<br>and UNU)<br>October 2018                                                                                                                                            |

| Revision history    | Reviewed by                   | Date       | Summary of changes         |
|---------------------|-------------------------------|------------|----------------------------|
| Version 1.0         | FORAM Management<br>Committee | 15.10.2018 | Improved narrative         |
| Version 2.0         | Internal review               | 18.10.2018 | Improved narrative         |
| Version 2.1         | FORAM Consortium<br>partners  | 26.10.2018 | Integration of<br>comments |
| Version 3.0 (Final) | Bas de Leeuw                  | 30.10.2018 | Final revision             |





#### Disclaimer

The contents of this document are the copyright of the FORAM consortium and shall not be copied in whole, in part, or otherwise reproduced (whether by photographic, reprographic or any other method), and the contents thereof shall not be divulged to any other person or organization without prior written permission. Such consent is hereby automatically given to all members who have entered into the FORAM Consortium Agreement, dated 20.10.2016, and to the European Commission to use and disseminate this information.

This information and content of this report is the sole responsibility of the FORAM consortium members and does not necessarily represent the views expressed by the European Commission or its services. Whilst the information contained in the documents and webpages of the project is believed to be accurate, the author(s) or any other participant in the FORAM consortium makes no warranty of any kind regarding this material.





#### **Executive Summary**

Deliverable D4.1 presents a roadmap for the establishment of a World Forum on Raw Materials or similar entity.

Based upon a synthesis of main results and conclusions of WP1-3, in particular as emerged from the Stakeholder Dialogue (D2.2), the Workshop Report of the Pilot Event (D4.2) and the Vision Document (D3.2), a set of key actions are elaborated.

This document as well as the deliverables of all previous phases will lead to a synthesis report (deliverable D4.3) which will present key recommendations.





### 1 Introduction

The project Towards a World Forum on Raw Materials (FORAM) has developed and set up an EU based platform of international experts and stakeholders that has been advancing the idea of a World Forum on Raw Materials, strengthening international cooperation among G20 Member countries as well as other third countries active in the extraction, processing and recycling of mineral raw materials.

The project thus plays a key role in fostering international cooperation on raw materials, supporting the implementation of the Raw Materials Initiative and the Strategic Implementation Plan of the European Innovation Partnership on Raw Materials, in particular in terms of "establishing and maintaining strong and sustainable relationships with relevant international organisations and countries", as described in the project's Grant Agreement.

FORAM is comprised of a consortium of twelve international organizations with expertise in setting and fostering international dialogues in the field of non-energy abiotic raw materials. Together with its Advisory Board and the established platform of international experts and stakeholders (FORAM Stakeholder Network) the project to date has reached out to and got inputs from more than 200 decision-makers and thought leaders in the sector worldwide.

The project had foreseen to evaluate and propose a roadmap towards the establishment of a World Forum on Raw Materials. In general, there is a strong interest in improving international cooperation on raw materials. Based upon the insights received in the earlier phases of the project, in particular the stakeholder mapping and consultation, clear consensus recommendations about the most preferred organisational structure for a new forum or network have not resulted from the discussions. Therefore, designing a detailed roadmap with concrete steps, timelines, content and financial prospects for a new entity, would have been premature and is not covered in this deliverable. Hence, this document concentrates on identifying other potential cooperation models and their scope, as well as next steps that the FORAM partners can take towards increasing international cooperation on raw materials.





## 2 Results Stakeholder Dialogue

One of the objectives of the FORAM project has been to reach out to stakeholders to get to know their needs, expand the network and explore synergies with relevant projects, initiatives, actions, policies or strategies including those in the areas of education, knowledge sharing, research, industry, markets and trade. To this end, a dialogue process was started among the stakeholders that revolved around the need for fair and unrestricted access to raw materials and for joint and coherent approaches towards raw materials supply, policy and investment.

During two series of web-based conference calls (held in February and May 2018) and a Pilot Event (27 June 2018), the stakeholders were invited to share experiences about their needs, threats, priorities and preferences with the aim to initiate exchanges and interactions that facilitate raw materials trade and for better coordination of relevant raw material initiatives and actions. The outcomes of the stakeholder dialogue have been reported in deliverables D2.2<sup>1</sup> (Report on Outcomes Stakeholder Consultation and Options for Better International Cooperation) and D4.2<sup>2</sup> (Pilot Event Meeting Report).

The following issues of interest have been identified and discussed in an interactive process with the consortium, Board and stakeholders:

- Innovation, security of supply and growth
- Resource-efficiency, environmental and social aspects
- Policies, legal and financial frameworks
- International cooperation and outreach
- Research, capacity building and education

Targeted discussions on these topics have been held with specific clusters of stakeholders, including bilateral dialogue, a series of web-based conference calls and culminating in a physical pilot event. For each of these issues, gaps in the area of raw materials knowledge management were identified, as well as specific needs for new policies and legislations. Furthermore, the question on how to include social and environmental standards in the value chain was addressed, as well as how to enhance international cooperation and outreach in these areas.

The following chapter summarizes the outcomes of the stakeholder consultation on the following questions:

• Chapter 2.1. What are the needs for improved collection of data and exchange of knowledge? What kind of ideas and proposals have been put forward to address the main needs by the stakeholders?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.foramproject.net/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/FORAM-D4.2.pdf





<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> <u>http://www.foramproject.net/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/FORAM-D2.2.pdf</u>



- Chapter 2.2. What options should be considered to improve international policy legislations and approaches?
- Chapter 2.3 What can be the role of a World Forum on Raw Materials in enhancing international cooperation on raw materials?

#### 2.1 Needs for improved collection of data and exchange of knowledge

Stakeholders have expressed the following needs:

- Despite the availability of various raw materials data systems, there is still the need for improving the quality and harmonizing between them,
- Accessibility of the data is a challenge. There is a global interest to share the data and knowledge by various means including online platforms or repositories,
- Most of the available databases show a distinct focus on primary raw materials and the development of similar systems for secondary materials is strongly recommended,
- A lack of databases in less developed countries, such as in Latin America and the Caribbean, and Africa, was identified,
- Need for awareness raising, education and capacity building on extraction, sharing and harmonization of data and knowledge on all levels and for all target groups of the raw materials value chain was mentioned.

#### 2.2 Options for improving international policy approaches and legislations

For improved policies and legislations on raw materials governance, following recommendations were given:

- Appropriate regulatory and financial frameworks for implementing raw materials policies, on national, regional and international levels, not only on primary raw materials but also on secondary raw materials and the circular economy (closed loop recycling). Developing public awareness, acceptance and trust, capacity building of state administration, effective taxation and environmental funds are needed to enforce policies. It was stressed that promoting, facilitating and monitoring transparency within the entire value chain of the raw materials is a necessity for policy makers to consider.
- Circularity should be integrated in new business models, and the "social license to operate" requires to also better involve local communities.
- UN-based conventions or international regulations, for instance on supply-chain transparency, social and environmental standards and policy frameworks, as well as





certification schemes to improve responsible mining and sourcing practices, were mentioned by many stakeholders as options to further explore.

• Potential of raw material sectors to contribute to the UN Sustainable Development Goals should be investigated, reported and monitored.

#### 2.3 Role of a World Forum on Raw Materials in enhancing international cooperation

During the stakeholder consultation process, a vivid interest in "breaking the silos" by improving international cooperation and outreach has been revealed. Even a resource-rich country needs to remain committed to international cooperation agreements, because scarcity of raw materials is a global challenge and countries depend on each other. Various ways to do so have been suggested (see chapter 3 of this report for more details), ranging from loose cooperation between the existing networks, set up web-based platforms, establishment of regional forums and/or by establishing a new international forum, together with selected partners, building upon and in synergy with the existing networks and initiatives.

Regardless of the question whether a brand-new forum would be set up or whether an entity would be created with similar focus (in this report both such physical and virtual network entity is referred to as "World Forum on Raw Materials" (FORAM) recommendations with regard to vision and tasks will be presented, as they emerged from the discussions.

Crafting a vision statement, as presented in deliverable D3.2<sup>3</sup>, has helped to clarify common understanding of the purpose, general aims and future role of the forum, and it is expected that this will be of great help in a next phase of consulting and discussing with potential stakeholders.

The purpose and vision were developed with the contribution of the FORAM project consortium and advisory board members and was discussed in the stakeholder dialogues.

The **purpose** of the World Forum on Raw Materials is to enhance international cooperation between all key-stakeholders (e.g. governments, industry, academia, NGOs) on raw materials policies and governance.

The **vision** of the World Forum on Raw Materials is to become an authoritative, independent and neutral organisation that supports cooperative actions to safeguard a sustainable use, as well as a fair and reliable global supply of mineral resources.

This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under Grant Agreement No 730127



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> http://www.foramproject.net/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/FORAM-D3.2.pdf



Such World Forum on Raw Materials (FORAM) is envisaged to have the following tasks:

- Provide a platform to share and improve global access to information: e.g. inventory of country databases on raw materials and fostering data harmonization. Develop a data format for reporting raw materials extraction and provisions for both primary and secondary raw materials.
- Foster ongoing dialogue and outreach between science and society. Discuss policies and policy recommendations. Engage the industry and other stakeholders in the value chain (mining, manufacturing, recycling) into the dialogue, promote interaction, and share best practices and innovations.
- Provide awareness raising and education materials and programs for all sectors and levels of the raw materials value chain, more specifically educating stakeholders from one specific sector (e.g. industry) about the challenges or issues in the other sectors.
- Promote out of the box thinking and reflecting on long-term vision on the role of primary and secondary raw materials in society.
- Design its own organizational structure with a view to best serve the needs of the stakeholders, keep the momentum, engage, motivate and expand the pool of experts and strategic partners, and safeguard financial resources, activity plans, and key performance indicators.

### 3 Recommended Organizational Models for improving International Cooperation

It can be concluded that the FORAM project has revealed a strong interest in improving international cooperation and has identified a strong need for improvements in data and policies on raw materials worldwide. As previously mentioned, the stakeholder consultation has resulted in broad sketches of a number of promising cooperation options and models, with establishment of a World Forum on Raw Materials being one of the several options. These models can be categorized as:

- Loose Cooperation: The lowest hanging fruit is to promote *loose cooperation* between existing initiatives and organizations. This can be done by attending each other's conferences, linking to each other websites or sharing their experiences, knowledge and data.
- *Joint Activities*: Somewhat closer cooperation models were suggested; whereby existing initiatives or organizations would agree to carry out *joint activities*. These activities can include co-organizing conferences/meetings, implementing stakeholder consultations, drafting joint policy statements, publishing joint reports and doing common research.
- Establishment of a platform that can be associated with an existing organization: A third cooperation model that was recommended by the stakeholders was to establish a platform composed of experts and relevant stakeholders coming from different sectors of the raw materials value chain. This can be a virtual (web-based) or a physical platform and may be developed from an already existing initiative or platform. Such a platform of stakeholders can act





as a hub for connecting other platforms, organize annual online or physical meetings associated with other conferences, or act as an inventory or repository of databases.

- Establishment of regional forums: Many international stakeholders believed that there is a lack of regional forums in many parts of the globe. This gap was also identified while mapping the existing initiatives in the first phase of the FORAM project. The mapping exercise has revealed that most initiatives have a 'global' focus followed by those with a focus on Europe. Around 10% of the initiatives have a national focus, and very view have a regional focus. During the mapping, no initiatives were identified that solely focus on Asia or South America.
- *Establishment of a new forum or entity*: Only very few participants suggested to set up a new entity or forum as a non-for-profit organization. Such an entity can be considered as "World Forum on Raw Materials" with a Secretariat, Board and Members. In Deliverable 3.3<sup>4</sup> (Strategic Position) of the project, the strategic position of such a forum have been defined and described in detail. This positioning is delineated having in consideration the values and the vision of the forum combined with an appraisal of stakeholders needs, the existing factors of competition and the knowable core competences that can be gathered in the future Forum. The steps towards the implementation of the strategy, including the definition of beneficiaries, activities, key partners and key resources of the future World Forum on Raw Materials are also outlined in this report. Such model would require interest of a champion organisation from governmental or private sector with sufficient funds and decision power that would like to initiate a forum. In Deliverable D.3.3 (Strategic Positioning), characteristics and core competencies of potential existing initiatives and organizations which can be incumbent for such a forum have been identified.

Recommended options and cooperation models for enhancing international cooperation on raw materials are summarized in Table 1.

The project had foreseen to evaluate and propose a roadmap towards the establishment of a World Forum on Raw Materials. Based upon the insights received in the earlier phases of the project, in particular from the stakeholder mapping and consultation, clear consensus proposals about the most preferred organisational structure for a new forum or network did not emerge from the discussions. Therefore, designing a roadmap with concrete steps, timelines, content, branding, structure, governance, including intellectual property rights, and a business plan with budget, and financial prospects, would be premature at this stage. In fact, not having detailed proposals for such a forum or entity can be regarded as a strategic advantage for the follow-up phase. Potential partners will be able to fundamentally influence and co-develop the initiative which is expected to increase the chances of enthusiasm, buy-in and support.

This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under Grant Agreement No 730127



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> http://www.foramproject.net/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/FORAM-D1.3.pdf



# 4 Key Stakeholders and Preferred Focus Areas for enhanced International Cooperation

For any cooperation model it is essential to identify the key stakeholders and the focus areas. During stakeholder consultation process, following groups and areas were highlighted (Table 1):

#### - Key Stakeholders

Based on the mapping analysis and consultation process, most of the existing initiatives or forums address in particular primary raw materials sector and they focus primarily on European Stakeholders. Each of these initiatives involve governments, business, research and NGO's as per their specific origin, history and networks. Secondary materials initiatives and non-European stakeholder networks are less common or are less connected to the international grid. A network involving both primary and secondary materials sectors, with stakeholders from all regions of the world, based upon a systemic consultation of potential stakeholders and identification and prioritization of needs does not exist.

Since international cooperation is more important than ever, cooperation between both resourcerich and resource-poor countries and engagement of both parties into the discussions is a necessity. Furthermore, it is crucial to encourage and involve stakeholders from all sectors of raw materials into negotiations. Current lack of processing, production and industry representatives needs to be considered for a future network of stakeholders or a World Forum on Raw Materials.

#### - Preferred Focus Areas

According to stakeholder consultations, key topics such as security of supply, standards, and environmental and social factors require priority attention. This holds true for setting up secondary materials initiatives. Moreover, systemic solutions require cooperation and information exchange between the primary and secondary sectors in a holistic setting. Two main focus areas identified by the FORAM stakeholders as the key solutions towards increasing international cooperation are knowledge management and policies and strategies.





Table 1. Recommended organizational models for improving international cooperation on raw materials (based on the FORAM Stakeholder Consultations)

| Recommended options towards enhancing international cooperation on raw materials |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Cooperation<br>Models                                                            | Loose-cooperation<br>(between interested<br>parties/platforms)                                                                                                                                                                      | Joint-activities<br>(between<br>interested<br>parties/platfor<br>ms)                                                                                                  | Establishment of a<br>platform/study group<br>associated with an<br>existing organization                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                        | Establishment of regional forums                                                                                                                                     | Establishment<br>of a new entity<br>or forum<br>(World Forum                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |  |  |  |
|                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                       | Virtual                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Physical                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                      | on Raw<br>Materials)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |  |  |  |
| Timeline                                                                         | Immediate                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Short-term                                                                                                                                                            | Medium                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | -term                                                                                  | Long-term                                                                                                                                                            | Long-term                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |  |  |  |
| Activities<br>(Examples)                                                         | <ul> <li>Attend each<br/>other's<br/>events/conferences</li> <li>Connect websites</li> <li>Share experiences<br/>knowledge and<br/>data</li> </ul>                                                                                  | <ul> <li>Co-organize<br/>events</li> <li>Draft joint<br/>policy<br/>statements</li> <li>Publish joint<br/>reports</li> <li>Conduct<br/>common<br/>research</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Organize and<br/>virtual/physi<br/>meetings ass<br/>with an ongo<br/>conference</li> <li>Organize sta<br/>consultation</li> <li>Reach-out to<br/>internationa<br/>stakeholders<br/>platforms</li> <li>Act as an inv<br/>or repository<br/>databases</li> </ul> | ical<br>sociated<br>bing<br>akeholder<br>as<br>o more<br>l<br>s and<br>rentory<br>y of | <ul> <li>Connecting<br/>regional<br/>stakeholders to<br/>each other</li> <li>Easier<br/>connection to<br/>continental and<br/>international<br/>platforms</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Provide a<br/>platform to<br/>share and<br/>improve<br/>global access<br/>to<br/>information</li> <li>Engage all<br/>stakeholders<br/>in the value<br/>chain into<br/>the dialogue<br/>and promote<br/>interaction</li> <li>Awareness<br/>raising and<br/>education<br/>materials for<br/>all sectors</li> </ul> |  |  |  |  |
| Key<br>Stakeholders                                                              | <ul> <li>FORAM partners as well as international stakeholders covering:</li> <li>primary and secondary raw materials sector</li> <li>entire raw materials value chain</li> <li>resource-rich and resource-poor countries</li> </ul> |                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |  |  |  |
| Preferred focus areas                                                            | <ul> <li>Knowledge Management</li> <li>Policies and Strategies</li> <li>Foster dialogue</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |  |  |  |





## 5 Next Steps for FORAM Platform

The formal FORAM project will finish at the end of October 2018. In two years, FORAM has received surprising recognition and visibility and has generated strong commitment, also on the personal level, between the various organisations. Most of the initiatives and networks identified (see deliverable 1.3 of WP1 "Baseline Report") have participated in the FORAM stakeholder consultation process. There is a clear potential for further exploring common grounds and areas for cooperation and thus it is recommended to use the FORAM partners, the FORAM network (Advisory Board and Stakeholder Network) and materials for deepening and broadening the work in progress. As concrete recommendations, stakeholders suggested that:

- The FORAM network can evolve into a platform for discussing global rules under standard protocols.
- The FORAM network can be a platform for discussing the level playing field outside UN events and negotiation process (informal expert-based discussions).
- FORAM can be a platform to hold data and knowledge together while leaving ownership to others.

Based on these recommendations, we expect that a small group of most interested parties will work together and implement the "joint-activities" model of cooperation on voluntary and self-funded bases and, in a short-term (2019-2020), tackle the implementation plan, which is explained below and shown in Figure 1.

#### Step 1 (January 2019):

Initiate a small Steering Committee of most interested partners, who together define specific criteria for the chosen cooperation strategy: content of cooperation, logistical and governmental issues, such as roles of members, with due attention to the mechanisms required to balance powers of the members and their duties, rights and advantages to secure the prosperity and viability of activity. The need to establishing Terms of References, bylaws, Memorandum of Understandings or Codes of Conducts will be reviewed. Potential events and conferences will be identified. Strategies to keep the FORAM Stakeholder Network (consortium, linked third parties, advisory board and the invited stakeholders) alive and active will be explored and evaluated.

#### Step 2 (October 2019):

Strategic partners, individuals and organizations that can leverage the joint activities will be identified. This includes international governmental organizations (such as United Nations, OECD, European Union, World Bank and World Trade Organization) and like-minded networks that promote international dialogue and cooperation, inclusive industry associations, certification providers and relevant other partners from civil society. In particular the group will also explore interest beyond the current group of experts, and reach out to China, and other countries in Asia-Pacific, as well as Latin America and the Caribbean, and Africa. Existing EC bilateral and trilateral dialogue processes





will be reviewed as well. Stakeholders that have not yet participated, or that were part of the platform but in a less active and enthusiastic way than originally expected, will be approached for intense bilateral dialogue.

Tentative annual minimum and optimal budgets will be estimated, with corresponding suggestions for a sustainably financing of the activity.

Several options for communication and networking events on several levels and for several target groups will be considered, planned and implemented. Accordingly, joint meetings and sessions will be organized and common projects will be identified and implemented.

#### Step 3 (January 2020):

Progress and effectiveness of the joint activities will be monitored, evaluated and mainstreamed. Challenges and opportunities will be identified. Structured and target-oriented fund-raising plans will be made to get proactive support and funds from major stakeholders, industry, governments and intergovernmental organizations. Action plan for the next stage of the cooperation will be defined. If needed, the MoU and other legal documents will be drafted and signed.



